

BIHAR RAJYA MADHYAHN BHOJAN YOJANA SAMITTI
Clarifications to Queries of Prospective Bidders

SL.	NAME OF FIRM	QUERY / REQUEST / SUGGESTION	SAMITTI'S CLARIFICATION
1	2	3	4
1.	Vinod Kumar Gupta & Associates	Relaxation sought to the eligibility criteria of an "operational branch office in Bihar, established at least 10 years prior to the date of submission of tender"	Not accepted
2.	Nirupam & Associates	Request for reducing to 5 years, the eligibility criteria of an "operational branch office in Bihar, established at least 10 (ten) years prior to the date of submission of tender"	Not accepted
3.	N.R. Baid & Co.	1. Request for waiver of EMD and Tender Cost in case of MSME firms 2. Request for disclosure of reasons for rejection of bid of any particular bidder.	1. Request declined 2. To be disclosure in Technical evaluation Proceeding. Which will be reflect on e.proc portal.
		3. Clarification as to the date as of which FCC is to be attached to substantiate existence of operational branch in Bihar for a period of 10 years or more.	3. Each of the last 10 years
		4. As indexation of all pages, including attach-ments, will not serve any purpose as such attachments are required to be uploaded in separate spaces meant for them, the requirement may be dispensed with.	4. In addition e-submission, submission of hard copy in spiral binding is also essential as per Clause 18.3 of the RFP.
4.	Komandoor & Co. LLP	1. Request for reducing to 5 years, the eligibility criteria of an "operational branch office in Bihar, established at least 10 (ten) years prior to the date of submission of tender"	Not accepted
5.	PSD & Associates	1. Request for reducing to 5 years, the eligibility criteria of an "operational branch office in Bihar, established at least 10 years prior to the date of submission of tender"	Not accepted
6.	CA Aatradeo Kumar	1. Request for including the age of operational branch in Bihar to continue under the ambit of technical evaluation and not making 10 years mandatory	Not accepted
7.	G.Mandal &Co.	Request for reverting to earlier eligibility condition: 1. Minimum number of CAs: Revert to 5 from the current criterion of 10 2. Minimum Average Annual Turnover for 3 years: Revertto Rs.40.00 L from the current Rs.70.00 L	Not accepted
8.	Barun & Co.	1. Minimum Average Annual Turnover for 3 years: Reducteto Rs.50.00 L from the current Rs.70.00 L 2. Minimum number of CAs: Reduce to 5 from the current criterion of 10	Not accepted

BIHAR RAJYA MADHYAHN BHOJAN YOJANA SAMITTI
Clarifications to Queries of Prospective Bidders

SL.	NAME OF FIRM	QUERY / REQUEST / SUGGESTION	SAMITTI'S CLARIFICATION
9.	K Hari Ji & Co.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Minimum Average Annual Turnover for 3 years: Reduce to Rs.60.00 L from the current Rs.70.00 L 2. Minimum number of CAs: Reduce to 7 from the current criterion of 10 3. Allow only such firms to participate whose branch in Bihar fulfil C&AG criterion for allotment of audit i.e. there should be a minimum of 2 partners. 4. Call for turnover and GST details of the branch as per Format III of C&AG's empanelment form 5. Peer review certificate can be part of marking but not a minimum criterion. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Request declined 2. Request declined 3. No change in criterion, RFP to stand. 4. No change, additional documents not intended for verification. 5. No change in Samitti's stand on this matter.
10.	Agarwal Tibrewal & Co	<p>Request for reconsidering the minimum requirement of 10 years as age of the branch office in Bihar as firm is of 40 years' standing but branch in Bihar was established only 2 years back.</p>	<p>Reconsidering declined.</p>
11.	Thakur Bhuwanesch & Associates Thakur Bhuwanesch & Associates (Contd.)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. As final MEF Certificate for FY 2025-26 is not yet received request for accepting MEF Certificate for FY 2024-25 with undertaking to submit the 2025-26 certificate, whenever received 2. Revise points for age of branch office in Bihar by allotting 10 points for 10 years and awarding 1 point for each additional year of existence while capping total points to 25 3. Accept Peer Review Certificate for FY 2024-25 4. Minimum number of CAs: Revert to 5 from the current criterion of 10 5. Previous experience: Will Internal Audit and Statutory Audit experience be treated at par with each other? 6. Does fixed audit fee include T/A/D/A, etc. 7. In case qualifying firms are less than 38, will more than one district be allotted to one firm? 8. RFP does not specify completion timeline 9. RFP does not mention number of schools per district and district-wise school distribution. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Accepted. 2. No change contemplated in this matter. 3. Will be accepted. 4. Request declined 5. Yes, that is the intent of the RFP. 6. Yes T/A/D/A include in audit fee. (All ready clear in clause no 18.5) 7. Will be mentioned in work-order 8. Will be mentioned in work-order 9. Will be mentioned in work-order
12.	KGRS & Co.		

Handwritten signature

Handwritten initials

Handwritten initials

BIHAR RAJYA MADHYAHN BHOJAN YOJANA SAMITTI
Clarifications to Queries of Prospective Bidders

SL.	NAME OF FIRM	QUERY / REQUEST / SUGGESTION	SAMITTI'S CLARIFICATION
13.	RSM & Associates	1. As the minimum age of FIRMS under eligibility criterion is 10 years, the requirement of 10 years old branch in Bihar may be deleted.	1. Not accepted.
		2. Either meeting minimum eligibility criteria OR obtaining minimum qualifying marks may be made sufficient conditions for selection. Replace "and" with "or" in Clause 14(A)(i)	2. Not accepted, as there will be no way of ranking the qualifying firm.
		3. In case empanelment of less than 38 firms, ensure equitable distribution of audit.	3. Will be ensured.
14.	Todi Tulsyan & Co.	Request for reducing the minimum criterion of 10 chartered accountants to 8	Request declined.
15.	Ansul Agrawal & Co.	A branch in Bihar should be taken as sufficient criterion and not weightage should be attached to the age of the branch.	Not accepted.
16.	Basant Kumar Singh & Co.	A branch in Bihar should be taken as sufficient criterion and not weightage should be attached to the age of the branch.	Not accepted.
17.	Agrawal Kanhaiya & Associates	Branch in Bihar has functioned from two different locations for a combined period of 13 years. Will marks be allotted considering 10 years or 13 years of existence?	Existence of a branch in Bihar for 10 years of more carries a flat 5 marks. Varying marks apply to the age of the firm.
18.	Devanshu N Sinha & Co	1. As the minimum age of FIRMS under eligibility criterion is 10 years, the requirement of 10 years old branch in Bihar may be deleted.	1. Not accepted.
		2. Either meeting minimum eligibility criteria OR obtaining minimum qualifying marks may be made sufficient conditions for selection. Replace "and" with "or" in Clause 14(A)(i)	2. Not accepted, as there will be no way of ranking the qualifying firm.
		3. In case empanelment of less than 38 firms, ensure equitable distribution of audit.	3. Will be ensured.
19.	Laxmi Tripti & Associates	It is against the rules and norms of ICAI to represent an ACA as FCA till the member has completed 5 years of practice and fulfilled all other requirements for being labelled an FCA. This must be kept in mind	Noted.

BIHAR RAJYA MADHYAHN BHOJAN YOJANA SAMITTI
Clarifications to Queries of Prospective Bidders

SL.	NAME OF FIRM	QUERY / REQUEST / SUGGESTION	SAMITTI'S CLARIFICATION
20.	Kadmawala & Co.	1. As a branch office and a head office carry the same authority, the requirement of 10 years old branch in Bihar may be deleted.	1. Not accepted.
		2. In situations where there are more than 4 FCA partners and no ACA partners the firm should not stand penalised due to absence of ACA partners.	2. Will be considered.
		3. Conflict between Clause "6.7" and Clause "18.2" as regards validity period of the bid/offer between 120 days and 180 days.	3. The figure of 120 in Clause "6.7" is a typographical error. Bid validity period will be 180 days as mentioned in Clause "18.2".
		4. Clarify whether hard copy submission is mandatory or supplementary to e-submission	4. While e-submission is primary it has to be backed up with a hard copy submission.
		5. Confirm that the process is strictly through e-tendering.	5. While e-submission is primary it must be backed up with a hard copy submission.
		6. Confirm that selection shall be based purely on technical evaluation and ranking.	6. Confirmed.
21.	Sadana & Co.	1. <i>Minimum Average Annual Turnover for 3 years: Reduce to Rs.50.00 L from the current Rs.70.00 L</i>	1. Not accepted
		2. Criterion of firms being empanelled with RBI may be waived as the assignment does not appear to require any of the skill sets required for audit of banks.	2. Not accepted
		3. Criterion of minimum 10 chartered accountants may be reconsidered.	3. Reconsidering declined
		4. Either experience in similar assignments be raised to 10 years or minimum age of operational branch in Bihar be reduced to 5 years	4. Request declined, both criteria to stay as they are.
22.	R N Sinha & Co.	Request for retaining the points structure for age of the firm without any change	Noted, no change intended.
23.	VKBK & Co.	Request for adding rent agreement to Firm Constitution Certificate as proof of maintaining a branch in Bihar for 10 years or more.	Request declined.

BIHAR RAJYA MADHYAHN BHOJAN YOJANA SAMITI
Clarifications to Queries of Prospective Bidders

SL.	NAME OF FIRM	QUERY / REQUEST / SUGGESTION	SAMITI'S CLARIFICATION
24.	CA Deepak Kumar CA Deepak Kumar (Contd.)	1. Request to raise existence of Head Office in Bihar to 10 years in line with similar requirement for branches in Bihar	1. Request declined. Firm's existence for 10 years is already a criterion. Continued presence in Bihar for 10 years or more will suffice.
		2. Request for considering experience of the firm in Bihar alone.	2. Request declined.
		3. Request for evolving a method for ranking of firms obtaining same marks.	3. Methodology will be decided by the Committee.
		4. Bid validity period mentioned as 120 at one place while 180 days at another	3. Bid validity period will be 180 days as mentioned in Clause "18.2".
		5. RFP indicates Auditor to prepare Financial Statement Report, which is the responsibility of the auditee.	4. Responsibility to be retained as mentioned in RFP.
		6. As the expected fee does not justify the criterion of minimum 10 chartered accountants, the same may be reduce to 5.	5. Request declined.
25.	Anant Dokania & Co. LLP	In case of firms converted to LLP within the last 10 years, it is not possible to extract Firm Constitution Certificates for the pre-conversion period. As such, request for accepting rent agreement for that period as valid evidence.	Request accepted.
26.	A T K & Associates	Request for relaxation in minimum age of branch in Bihar	Request declined.
27.	Vinay Naveen & Co.	Request for relaxation in minimum age of branch in Bihar	Request declined.

Answer

AS

AS